

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA**

*IN RE CATTLE AND BEEF ANTITRUST
LITIGATION*

Case No. 22-md-3031 (JRT/JFD)

This Document Relates To:

ALL ACTIONS BROUGHT BY DIRECT
ACTION PLAINTIFFS

**JOINT STIPULATION (1) GOVERNING THE PROCESS BY WHICH ANY FUTURE
MDL DAP SHALL JOIN THE CONSOLIDATED COMPLAINT AND (2) GOVERNING
THE PROCESS BY WHICH DEFENDANTS SHALL ANSWER OR OTHERWISE
RESPOND TO COMPLAINTS FILED BY ANY FUTURE MDL DAPS (OR BY WHICH
THEIR PRIOR ANSWER TO THE CONSOLIDATED COMPLAINT SHALL
APPLY TO COMPLAINTS FILED BY ANY FUTURE MDL DAPS)**

The Court's Order at ECF 91 provides that, by January 30, 2023, the Parties shall file a proposed order (1) governing the process by which any future MDL DAP shall join the Consolidated Complaint, including a proposed short-form complaint if appropriate, and (2) governing the process by which Defendants shall answer or otherwise respond to the complaints filed by any future MDL DAPs (or by which their prior answer to the Consolidated Complaint shall apply to future DAPs' complaints).

Accordingly, the Parties stipulate to the following procedure that the Court may so order if acceptable to the Court:

1. Any future MDL DAP shall join the Consolidated Complaint by filing a Notice of Joinder in the Consolidated Complaint (Notice) within 14 days of being transferred to the MDL Court or if filed initially in the District of Minnesota the Notice shall be the case initiating pleading.

2. The Notice of Joinder shall indicate:
 - a. All MDL DAPs joining in the Notice;
 - b. Any assignments on which the respective MDL DAP(s)' claims are based in whole or in part;
 - c. The defendants against which the future MDL DAP(s) is/are asserting its claim or claims and the claim or claims in the Consolidated Complaint that the future MDL DAP is joining;
 - d. All alleged non-Defendant co-conspirators; and
 - e. The definition of "Beef" adopted by the MDL DAP(s).

Defendants' Answers and affirmative defenses to the Consolidated Complaint and any order(s) from the Court on any dispositive motion relating to claims of all DAPs covered in the Consolidated Complaint, shall apply to such future MDL DAPs that join the Consolidated Complaint. However, if a Defendant maintains that one or more affirmative defenses uniquely applies to a future MDL DAP, the Defendant shall file a short form Answer identifying such affirmative defenses within 30 days of the Notice.

Dated: January 30, 2022.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Philip J. Iovieno

Philip J. Iovieno

Jack G. Stern

Mark A. Singer

Justin V. Arborn

CADWALADER, WICKERSHAM & TAFT
LLP

200 Liberty Street

New York, NY 10281

philip.iovieno@cwt.com

jack.stern@cwt.com

mark.singer@cwt.com

justin.arborn@cwt.com

/s/ Holley C. M. Horrell

X. Kevin Zhao, Reg. No. 0391302

Holley C. M. Horrell, Reg. No. 0399636

Davida S. McGhee Williams, Reg. No.

0400175

GREENE ESPEL PLLP

222 S. Ninth Street, Suite 2200

Minneapolis, MN 55402

(612) 373-0830

kzhao@greeneespel.com

hhorrell@greeneespel.com

dwilliams@greeneespel.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiff Aramark
and Co-Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiff
Kraft and Liaison Counsel for Direct Action
Plaintiffs***

Patrick J. Ahern
AHERN AND ASSOCIATES, P.C.
Willoughby Tower
8 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 3600
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Ph: (312) 404-3760
patrick.ahern@ahernandassociatespc.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs Winn-
Dixie Stores, Inc., Bi-Lo Holdings, LLC and
Co-Counsel for Kraft Heinz Foods Company***

Richard Alan Arnold
William J. Blechman
Kevin J. Murray
Douglas H. Patton
Samuel J. Randall
Michael A. Ponzoli
KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.
1441 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1100
Miami, FL 33131
rarnold@knpa.com
wblechman@knpa.com
kmurray@knpa.com
dpattson@knpa.com
srandall@knpa.com
mponzoli@knpa.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs The
Kroger Co., Hy-Vee, Inc., Save Mart
Supermarkets US Foods, Inc. and
Albertsons Companies, Inc.***

Paul E. Slater
Joseph M. Vanek
David P. Germaine
Phillip F. Cramer
Alberto Rodriguez
Jeffrey H. Bergman
SPERLING & SLATER, P.C.
55 West Monroe Street
Suite 3200
Chicago, IL 60603
pes@sperling-law.com
jvanek@sperling-law.com
dgermaine@sperling-law.com

Britt M. Miller (*pro hac vice*)
Matthew Provance (*pro hac vice*)
MAYER BROWN LLP
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
(312) 782-0600
bmiller@mayerbrown.com
mprovance@mayerbrown.com

William H. Stallings (*pro hac vice*)
MAYER BROWN LLP
1999 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-1101
(202) 263-3338
wstallings@mayerbrown.com

Jacob D. Bylund (*pro hac vice*)
FAEGRE DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH
LLP
801 Grand Avenue, 33rd Floor
Des Moines, IA 50309
(515) 248-9000

Beth A. Wilkinson
Kosta Stojilkovic
WILKINSON STEKLOFF LLP
2001 M Street, NW, 10th Floor
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 847-4010
bwilkinson@wilkinsonstekloff.com
kstoilkovic@wilkinsonstekloff.com

Maira Penza
WILKINSON STEKLOFF LLP
130 W 42nd Street, Floor 24
New York, NY 10036
(212) 294-8914
mpenza@wilkinsonstekloff.com

***Counsel for Defendants Cargill,
Incorporated and Cargill Meat Solutions
Corporation***

/s/ Benjamin L. Ellison
Benjamin L. Ellison, Reg. No. 0392777
Chelsea A. Bunge-Bollman, Reg. No. 0401297
JONES DAY
90 South Seventh Street, Suite 4950
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel.: (612) 217-8862
bellison@jonesday.com
cbungebollman@jonesday.com

pcramer@sperling-law.com
arodriguez@sperling-law.com
jbergman@sperling-law.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs
Associated Grocers of the South, Inc., Dollar
General Corporation, Dolgencorp, LLC,
Meijer, Inc., Meijer Distribution, Inc.,
Publix Super Markets, Inc., Raley's, United
Natural Foods, Inc., Supervalu, Inc.,
Associated Grocers of Florida, Inc., Unified
Grocers, Inc., Tony's Fine Foods, and
Wakefern Food Corp.***

David B. Esau
Kristin A. Gore
Garth T. Yearick
Amanda R. Jesteadt
CARLTON FIELDS, P.A.
525 Okeechobee Boulevard
Suite 1200
West Palm Beach, FL 33401
desau@carltonfields.com
kgore@carltonfields.com
gyearick@carltonfields.com
ajeastadt@carltonfields.com

Aaron A. Holman
CARLTON FIELDS, P.A.
200 S. Orange Avenue, Suite 1000
Orlando, FL 32801
Tel: (407) 244-8229
Fax: (407) 648-9099
Email: aholman@carltonfields.com

Scott L. Menger
CARLTON FIELDS, LLP
2029 Century Park East, Suite 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90067
Tel: (310) 843-6300
Fax: (310) 843-6301
Email: smenger@carltonfields.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs Cheney
Brothers, Inc. and Subway Protein
Litigation Corp., as Litigation Trustee of the
Subway® Protein Litigation Trust,
Restaurant Services, Inc., Sonic Industries
Services Inc., Whatabrands LLC,
Whataburger Restaurants LLC, WB Supply
& Merchandising LLC, ARCOP, Inc., and
CKE Restaurants Holdings, Inc.***

Julia E. McEvoy (*pro hac vice*)
JONES DAY
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001-2113
Tel.: (202) 879-3867
jmcevoy@jonesday.com

Michelle Fischer (*pro hac vice*)
JONES DAY
901 Lakeside Avenue
North Point
Cleveland, OH 44114
Tel.: 216-586-3939
mfischer@jonesday.com

Tiffany Lipscomb-Jackson (*pro hac vice*)
JONES DAY
325 John H. McConnell Blvd., Suite 600
Columbus, OH 43215
Tel.: 614-281-3939
tdlipscombjackson@jonesday.com

Eddie Hasdoo (*pro hac vice*)
JONES DAY
77 W. Wacker Dr., Suite 3500
Chicago, IL 60601
Tel.: 312-269-4214
ehasdoo@jonesday.com

***Counsel for Defendant National Beef
Packing Company, LLC***

/s/ Sami H. Rashid
Donald G. Heeman, Reg. No. 0286023
Jessica J. Nelson, Reg. No. 0347358
Randi J. Winter, Reg. No. 0391354
SPENCER FANE
100 South Fifth Street, Suite 2500
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel.: (612) 268-7000
dheeman@spencerfane.com
jnelson@spencerfane.com
rwinter@spencerfane.com

Stephen Neuwirth (*pro hac vice*)
Michael Carlinsky (*pro hac vice*)
Sami H. Rashid (*pro hac vice*)
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN LLP
51 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10010
Tel.: (212) 849-7000
stephenneuwirth@quinnemanuel.com

Eric R. Lifvendahl
L&G LAW GROUP, LLP
175 W. Jackson, Suite 950
Chicago, IL 60604
elifvendahl@lgcounsel.com
Richard L. Coffman
THE COFFMAN LAW FIRM
3355 W. Alabama Street, Suite 240
Houston, TX 77098
rcoffman@coffmanlawfirm.com

Bernard D. Marcus
Moiria Cain-Mannix
Brian C. Hill
Erin Gibson Allen
MARCUS & SHAPIRA LLP
One Oxford Center
35th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
marcus@marcus-shapira.com
cain-mannix@marcus-shapira.com
hill@marcus-shapira.com
Allen@marcus-shapira.com

Robert N. Kaplan
Elana Katcher
Matthew P. McCahill
KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER, LLP
850 Third Avenue
14th Floor
New York, NY 10022
rkaplan@kaplanfox.com
ekatcher@kaplanfox.com
mmccahill@kaplanfox.com

Bernard D. Marcus
Moiria Cain-Mannix
Brian C. Hill
Marcus & Shapira LLP
One Oxford Center, 35th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
Tel: (412) 471-3490
Fax: (412) 391-8758
Email: marcus@marcus-shapira.com Email:
cain-mannix@marcus-shapira.com
Email: hill@marcus-shapira.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs Action
Meat Distributors, Inc., Affiliated Foods,
Inc., Alex Lee, Inc., Associated Food Stores,
Inc., Big Y Foods, Inc., Brookshire
Brothers, Inc., Brookshire Grocery
Company, Colorado Boxed Beef Co., Prefco***

michaelcarlinsky@quinnemanuel.com
samirashid@quinnemanuel.com

Lewis A. Remele, Jr., Reg. No. 90724
Christopher R. Morris, Reg. No. 230613
BASSFORD REMELE, P.A.
100 South 5th Street, Suite 1500
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel.: (612) 333-3000
lremele@bassford.com
cmorris@bassford.com

William F. Hargens (*pro hac vice*)
Patrick E. Brookhouser, Jr. (*pro hac vice*)
MCGRATH NORTH MULLIN & KRATZ,
PC LLO
First National Tower, Suite 3700
1601 Dodge Street
Omaha, NE 68102
Tel: (402) 341-3070
whargens@mcgrathnorth.com
pbrookhouser@mcgrathnorth.com

***Counsel for Defendants JBS USA Food
Company, JBS Packerland, Inc., Swift Beef
Company, and JBS S.A.***

/s/ Ulrike B. Connelly
Susan E. Foster (*pro hac vice*)
Ulrike B. Connelly (*pro hac vice*)
Tiffany Lee (*pro hac vice*)
Hannah Parman (*pro hac vice*)
PERKINS COIE LLP
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900
Seattle, WA 98101-3099
Tel: (206) 359-8846
sfoster@perkinscoie.com
uconnelly@perkinscoie.com
tiffanylee@perkinscoie.com
hparman@perkinscoie.com

Jon B. Jacobs (*pro hac vice*)
PERKINS COIE LLP
700 13th Street, NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
Tel: (202) 654-1758
bjjacobs@perkinscoie.com

Barry G. Stratford (*pro hac vice*)
PERKINS COIE LLP
2901 N. Central Avenue
Suite 2000
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2788

***Distribution, LLC, The Golub Corporation,
Nicholas & Co., Inc., PFD Enterprises, Inc.,
SpartanNash Company, Springfield Grocer
Company, The Distribution Group, Inc.,
Topco Associates, LLC, Troyer Foods, Inc.,
Unipro Foodservice, Inc., URM Stores, Inc.
and Giant Eagle, Inc.***

Scott E. Gant
Michael S. Mitchell
Cameron Miller
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
1401 New York Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005
sgant@bsfllp.com
mmitchell@bsfllp.com
cmiller@bsfllp.com

Colleen Harrison
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
333 Main Street
Armonk, NY 10504
charrison@bsfllp.com

Sarah L. Jones
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
725 South Figueroa Street
Los Angeles, California 90017
sjones@bsfllp.com

***Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs Sysco
Corporation and Amory Investments LLC***

Tel: (602) 351-8000
bstratford@perkinscoie.com

Caroline Gizem Tunca (*pro hac vice*)
PERKINS COIE LLP
110 North Wacker Drive, Suite 3400
Chicago, Illinois 60606
Tel: (312) 324-8400
ctunca@perkinscoie.com

David P. Graham, Reg. No. 0185462
DYKEMA GOSSETT, PLLC
4000 Wells Fargo Center
90 South 7th Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 486-1521
dgraham@dykema.com

***Counsel for Defendants Tyson Foods, Inc.,
and Tyson Fresh Meats, Inc.***